

**Presbytery of the Miami Valley Stated Meeting  
ORDER OF THE DOCKET  
November 12, 2022, at 9:00 a.m.  
ON ZOOM**

**We hope to be able to Livestream the meeting. This link will take you to the Youtube channel for Miami Valley Presbytery:**

<https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCg5xdqkKB5iO8dKZ6DcaP-g>

**Zoom Protocols can be found in the papers on the website. (ZP)**

**Please have your Communion Elements prepared before we begin.**

**PREPARE**

NOTE: MWS = Minister of Word and Sacrament  
RE = Ruling Elder

**9:00 am Convening Prayer & Welcome**

MWS Sarah Sparks-Franklin, Moderator

+ **Minute for Good News – please share your Good News Moments in Chat!**

+ **Zoom protocol reminder.** Voting using polls.

+ **Welcome** to any first-time commissioners with us today.

+ **COM** MWS Anna Owens, COM Vice-Chair

**Recognition of New Pastors in our Midst**

MWS Annie Melick, Eaton  
MWS Joungnam Lee, IKPC

**Memorial**

MWS David Girbert, HR (A-7)

+ **Declaration of Quorum** MWS Sarah Sparks-Franklin

+ **Formation of the Roll** MWS Lynn Bova, Stated Clerk

**ON MOTION:** to Seat Corresponding Member, MWS Mihee Kim-Kort from the Presbytery of Baltimore and to approve Excused Minister Members.

**ON MOTION:** to grant voice to Deacon Bryce Wiebe, Melanie Monzon and John Bailer from the Columbia Partnership.

+ **Passing of the Peace**

+ **Adoption of the Docket**

**ON MOTION:** Adoption of the Docket (A-1)

**Please have your Communion Elements prepared before we begin.**

**Hospitality Report**

CRE Gidget Collins

+ **Minute for Good News**

+ **Greetings:** Host Church, Seven Mile Presbyterian – video (or pics)

+ **Mission at Every Meeting** – for more information on the mission opportunities selected by Seven Mile Presbyterian Church. (I-1)

*Mission at every meeting supports our involvement as a Matthew 25 Presbytery.*

+ **Land Acknowledgement**

CRE Gidget Collins  
(I-7)

**Breakout Session:**

**Hearing Hearts: Learning to Listen**

Deacon Bryce Wiebe

We will be breaking into groups of two to practice. Please be prepared to talk uninterrupted about “Who in your life makes you feel heard?” for about 2 minutes.

**Report of the Stated Clerk**

MWS Lynn Bova

+ **Minute for Good News**

**Other Items for Action or Information**

- + **For Approval** in the Consent Agenda (A-2)
  - Minutes** for September Stated meeting, (A-3)
  - Minutes** from Administrative Commission to install Mike Wakeland at Xenia United Presbyterian (A-4)
  - Minutes** from Administrative Commission to install Carol Pierson at Sidney Presbyterian (A-5)

+ **Correspondence** - received 3<sup>rd</sup> quarter Special Offering impact report for the churches in this presbytery and PILP report.

+ **Minute Review** – Final report on 2020 and 2021 Minutes. (A-6)

The following churches have not completed their minute review:

- Blue Ball (scheduled for Nov. 14)
- IKPC
- Huntsville
- Jamestown
- Middletown, St. Luke
- Rushsylvania
- West Liberty
- Yellow Springs (it appears they have been read but no report was received)

+ **Statistical reports** – the portal will open on Dec. 2 for churches. I will be contacting clerks of session with additional information. A zoom gathering is planned to answer questions on Nov. 30 for clerks.

November 12, 2022

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

+ **GA Book of Order proposed changes** –Meetings to discuss the proposed changes to the Book of Order made by the General Assembly 2022 will be held on Zoom on the following dates:

Wed., Dec. 7 at 7 pm & Sat. Dec. 10 at 9:30 am

Wed., Jan 25 at 7 pm & Sat. Jan. 28 at 9:30 am

Wed., February 15 at 7 pm & Sat. Feb. 18 at 9:30 am

Topics will be shared prior to the meetings with registration information.

GA Actions and Proposed Amendments to the Constitution.

(I-2 & 3)

+ **Upcoming 2022 - 2023 Presbytery Meeting Dates**

Currently planned locations:

<p>Saturday, February 11, 2023, 9:00 a.m., ZOOM (Host: Corinth Presbyterian)          Reports and docket requests due by January 30</p> <p>Tuesday, May 9, 2023, 3:00 p.m., at Fairborn Presbyterian          Reports and docket requests due by April 26</p> <p>Tuesday, September 12, 2023, 3:00 p.m., at Xenia United          Reports and docket requests due by August 30</p> <p>Saturday, November 11, 2023, 9:00 a.m., ZOOM (Host: TBA)          Reports and docket requests due by Oct. 30</p>
--

We are grateful to these churches for agreeing to host. Churches interested in hosting stated presbytery meetings in future years are encouraged to contact the Stated Clerk. We encourage our smaller churches who might not be able to host an in-person meeting to host a Zoom meeting in November or February.

+**Membership and Minister Changes** since the September 2022 stated presbytery meeting:

a. Gains: Jounghnam Lee (from Homestead)

b. Losses: Kevin Murphy (Cincinnati), David Girbert (to the Lord’s Loving Care)

c. In transition: Laura Nile Tuell (to Cascades Presbytery), Darcy Metcalf (to Maumee Valley)

+**Realm Update** - Church Data Form and Pastor Information Form

(I-4, I- 5)

**Leadership Council**

MWS Amy Duiker, Chair

+ **Minute for Good News**

+ **ON MOTION:** Adoption of the Consent Agenda

(A-2)

+ **Consideration of Action Items**, if any, pulled from the Consent Agenda.

+ **Presentation** to call MWS Terry Kukuk to an additional 5-year term.

MWS Lawrence Bartel, Staff Support

**ON MOTION:** to renew the contract for our Executive Presbyter, MWS Terry Kukuk, for an additional 5 years beginning March 1, 2023.

+ **Presentation** of the 2023 Budget and Terms of Call for EP and SC

(RE Georgie Woessner, Chair of Trustees and John Ey, Treasurer)

**ON MOTION:** to approve the 2023 Budget including the Terms of Call for the Executive Presbyter Terry Kukuk and the Stated Clerk MWS Lynn Bova. (A-9 & 9a)

**+ Proposed bylaw change**

**ON MOTION:** to approve the following bylaw change to section 2.02 and 2.03. (This was provided for a first reading at the September stated presbytery meeting.)

**Bylaw Change Recommendation:**

To change the Bylaws section 2.02 and 2.03 (see below) to help with the continuing imbalance of MWS and RE by seating each Ruling Elder member of Committee on Ministry and Committee on Preparation for Ministry as a presbytery commissioner (usually 9 RE on COM and 4 RE on CPM) and giving each congregation with more than 250 members 2 commissioners to begin following the May 2023 presbytery meeting.  
1-249 members – 1 commissioner and  
250 or more - 2 commissioners.

Currently our bylaws state (with strike through and changes in red):

**Section 2.02: Representatives of Churches**

Each session under the jurisdiction of the presbytery shall be represented at each meeting of the presbytery by the number of ruling elders directed by the following active membership calculations:

- 1 – ~~400~~249 members: 1 ruling elder
- ~~401~~—800 250 or more members: 2 ruling elders
- ~~801~~—1200 members: ~~3~~ ruling elders

Whenever a session is not represented by a regularly elected ruling elder commissioner at four consecutive Stated Meetings without excuses satisfactory to the presbytery, the session shall be notified in writing by the Stated Clerk and shall be requested to render satisfactory reason for this absence.

**Section 2.03: Ruling Elder Members of the Presbytery**

Ruling elders elected to serve as: Moderator, Vice-Moderator, Leadership Council Chair, a member of the Leadership Council, **a member of the Committee on Ministry, a member of the Committee on Preparation for Ministry**, a chairperson of a standing committee, Executive Presbyter, and Stated Clerk shall be enrolled as ruling elder members of the presbytery for the duration of service in these positions, whether or not commissioned by their sessions.

**Rationale:** these Ruling Elders are already actively engaged in the work of the presbytery, and it might be helpful for them to hear and speak into decisions especially as they are not represented on Leadership Council. We continue to have fewer churches and fewer members and changing the number of commissioners from congregations and from presbytery committees will help with the imbalance of both numbers of commissioners and those who actually attend meetings.

**+ Announcements & Information:** Please like our Facebook Page and sign up for Constant Contact. We have a new YouTube channel called Miami Valley Presbytery. You can find links to these on the Presbytery website:  
<https://miamipresbytery.org/>.

**Committee on Ministry**

MWS Anna Owens, Vice-Chair

**+ Minute for Good News**

**+ PC(USA) Book of Order, G-3.0109 b (5), Administrative Commissions:**

November 12, 2022

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

*Administrative commissions are designated to consider and conclude matters not involving ecclesiastical judicial process, except that in the discharge of their assigned responsibilities they may discover and report to the designating council matters that may require judicial action by the council.*

*Functions that may be entrusted to administrative commissions include, but are not limited to:*

*(5) (by presbyteries, synods, and the General Assembly) visiting particular councils, congregations, or agencies over which they have immediate jurisdiction reported to be affected with disorder, and inquiring into and settling the difficulties therein, except that no commission of a presbytery shall be empowered to dissolve a pastoral relationship without the specific authorization by the designating body (G-2.0901).*

## **Background or Report of Disorder**

The Committee on Ministry has become aware of serious, unresolved conflicts within College Hill Community Presbyterian Church that are endangering the life and ministry of the congregation. As such, the Committee on Ministry is reporting to the Presbytery that the congregation is affected with disorder.

A variety of serious difficulties associated with church leadership at College Hill have been reported to the Committee on Ministry, specifically relating to the Session and the Pastor/Moderator. These problems have been enumerated by a substantial number of questions and complaints from a significant number of individuals, as well as requests for presbytery assistance by these individuals. Many of these individuals are ordained Ruling Elders and Deacons who have called, emailed, and written letters to the Committee on Ministry.

To list a few of these concerns:

1. The Session has closed itself off from the congregation, refusing requests for attendance at meetings, and leaving correspondence to the Session from concerned members unanswered. Though closing Session meetings is technically permitted per Robert's Rules of Order, it must be done by formal vote of the Session and recorded in the Session meetings. As of this writing, the Committee on Ministry has no confirmation that this vote was taken. Additionally, a non-Presbyterian pastor, who is not an installed member of the Session, has voice. This, too, must be done by formal vote of the Session, and, again, as of this writing, there is no evidence that this vote has taken place. (G-3.0107/G-3.0201)
2. Members of the congregation have been removed from congregational meetings, Session meetings, and committee meetings by the pastor and the Session due to disagreements over membership, policy, and practice. This does not follow the process outlined in the Rules of Discipline. (D-1.0103)
3. Congregational meetings (G-1.05) have been conducted in a manner not in line with the Book of Order's requirements for decency and order to be maintained. Specifically, a member stood up to address concerns about the pastor and the Session, and her membership was publicly questioned by the pastor and Session, who conferred together and claimed this member was, in fact, not in active membership status and requested that she leave the meeting. The person in question was a member, and no public acknowledgment or apology was ever made. This information should have been readily available from the clerk of session "...shall keep its rolls of membership and attendance, maintain any required registers..." (G-3.0204, see also G - 3.0204a Membership Roll)
4. Requests for recordings of congregational meetings have been refused to people who were in attendance. In consultation with the denomination, it has been stated that recordings become

November 12, 2022

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

part of the official record and the bylaws should reflect how electronic meetings are held and who has access to and if a motion to record is required. No request to record appears to have been made.

5. Non-members have been baptized, despite expressing limited interest in becoming members. While this is technically allowed per our polity, there is no record that the Session approved these baptisms following the instructions in the Book of Order (W-3.0403).
6. The pastor has assumed the responsibility of chairing committees. This practice does not seem to uphold the Bylaws of College Hill Community Church stating that “the lead officer of all organizations, ministering units, committees and task forces shall be an active member or friend of the congregation.” The pastor holds membership in the Presbytery.
7. An installed elder was removed from a Session meeting and received a formal letter dictating that she not participate in further committee meetings until conflict resolution process had been observed. This process, as well as the removal of an installed elder, does not follow the Book of Discipline’s process for removing an installed elder. Additionally, this decision was made in a called Session meeting that changed the purpose of the meeting without notifying all members prior to the meeting. (G-3.0203)
8. The pastor and Session have arranged votes regarding moving the pastor’s status from Stated Supply to Installed. This has been done without authority from the Committee on Ministry and does not follow the Presbytery’s requirements for this to take place (Presbytery of the Miami Valley Policy and Practice Handbook, Committee on Ministry, practice 2.04)
9. The Clerk of Session has failed to keep appropriate records for Session meetings and Congregational meetings, which violates the BoO (G-3.0104 and G-3.0204 and G-3.0107).
10. The Session and the pastor asked the Committee on Ministry for an exemption to electing elders in 2021, though it has been stated that there was a slate of elders prepared by the nominating committee for that year.

These are only a few of the many expressions of concern that have come to the attention of the Committee on Ministry of the Presbytery of the Miami Valley. Collectively, they reflect serious dysfunction.

### **Purpose:**

The Committee on Ministry recommends pursuant to the Book of Order provisions G-3.0109b (5) that the Presbytery authorize the Moderator to appoint an Administrative Commission to work with College Hill Community Presbyterian Church. The Commission will consist of five (5) presbyters, at least one of whom shall be a member of the Committee on Ministry, with the remaining members representing an even distribution of teaching and ruling elders from churches in the Presbytery of the Miami Valley, for the following purposes, including but not limited to:

- a. Working with the Session, Pastor, and congregation to address the causes of division and disorder, and to seek ways to encourage constructive resolution on the issues;
- b. Working with the Session, Pastor, and congregation in addressing issues of relationships and expectations among pastor, officers, staff, and members;
- c. Providing at least two (2) persons of the Administrative Commission to attend all Session meetings with voice (but no vote) and to provide leadership where necessary and appropriate;
- d. Reporting its progress to the Committee on Ministry monthly,
- e. Providing an initial report of its findings and recommendations to the Presbytery of the Miami Valley at the next immediate stated meeting following its appointment; and
- f. Providing regular reports to the presbytery thereafter until completion.

### **Scope and Authority**

November 12, 2022

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

It is further recommended that this Administrative Commission have the full authority of Presbytery of the Miami Valley in addressing this matter with the congregation., except where limited by the Presbyterian Church (USA)'s Book of Order. If it is determined by the Administrative Commission that the Session of College Hill Community Presbyterian Church in Dayton, Ohio cannot exercise its authority, or is unable or unwilling to manage wisely its affairs, the Administrative Commission of the Presbytery of the Miami Valley, after a thorough investigation and a full opportunity to be heard is given to all parties involved, has the authority to assume original jurisdiction with full powers of the Session, in which case the Session of the College Hill Community Presbyterian Church will cease to act until such time as the Presbytery shall otherwise direct (G-3.0303e).

**ON MOTION:** The Committee on Ministry of the Presbytery of Miami Valley recommends that the Presbytery of Miami Valley to appoint an Administrative Commission for College Hill Community Presbyterian Church as described above. The Moderator of the Presbytery is to appoint the members according to our bylaws Article VI, Section 6.02.

+ **Reminder** that the BOP dues for pastor's participation will increase 2% to 39%.

**Presbytery Covenant** - We read together a part of the Mission Statement. (C-1)

**EQUIP**

**Synod Executive's Report**  
+ **Minute for Good News**

MWS Chip Hardwick  
(A-10)

**Executive Presbyter's Report**  
+ **Minute for Good News**

MWS Terry Kukuk

**NURTURE**

**Nominations Committee**  
+ **Minute for Good News**

RE Marge Morgan, Chair

+ **ON MOTION:** the Committee nominates the following names to Presbytery committees and Council:

*(Note: The Nominations Committee continues to seek to fill vacant committee slots.)*

**Leadership Council**

Class of 2025  
RE Robin DeWine, Xenia United

**Committee on Ministry**

Class of 2025  
MWS Annie Melick, Eaton  
MWS Carol Pierson, Sidney

**CPM –**

MWS Kelley Shin, Chair

**ON MOTION:** to approve the following readers for ordination exams: RE Anne Brienza and MWS Ted Dennis.

November 12, 2022

Presbytery of the Miami Valley

**Committee Reports –**

+ **Synod Commissioners Report**

RE Mary Jean Blackmon

+ **Network Support and Grants**

The Columbia Network

Melanie Monzon and John Bailer

+ **Committee on Representation and Diversity**

(A-11)

RE Diane Welborn

**Acknowledgement of Written Reports**

**Staff Support**

(A-12)

**Financial Reports**

(A-13)

**ON MOTION:** to receive the reports.

CONNEC 

**Moderator's Report**

MWS Sarah Sparks-Franklin

+ **Minute for Good News**

+ **Announcements –**

+ **ON MOTION: Adjournment.**

Benediction & Adjournment

***Our next stated presbytery meeting***

*Saturday, February 11, 2023 at 9:00 a.m.*

***on Zoom***

*Hosted by Corinth Presbyterian Church*